

EXHIBIT 12

2008 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR LONG TERM DEER MANAGEMENT

Recommendations for Long Term Deer Management

1. *The Municipality will develop educational materials that will provide citizens with information on urban deer population dynamics and non-lethal methods that can be implemented on private property to reduce damage. This may include site visits to determine the most cost effective landscaping alternatives or exclusionary devices.*

In 2007 the Municipality of Mt. Lebanon entered into a Cooperative Service Agreement (CSA) with the U. S. Department of Agriculture (USDA) Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service (APHIS) Wildlife Services (WS) to prepare a review of white tail deer management options and recommendations for long term population control (Deer Management Plan). Section 3 of the plan addresses non-lethal, as well as, lethal options for managing the deer population within the Municipality. The plan is posted on the Municipal website and is available at the Mt. Lebanon Library for all residents to review. The plan lists numerous references where residents can find additional information on deer management. Representatives from the USDA Wildlife Services have attended numerous Mt. Lebanon Commission Discussion Sessions to answer the concerns of residents as they were presented to member of the Mt. Lebanon Commission. Special deer management public meeting were held on September 25, 2007 and August 25, 2008 during which Wildlife Services presented its final reports on the 2006/2007 and 2007/2008 programs and made recommendation for the upcoming year. Following both presentations the Commission took public comment on the issue and representatives from Wildlife Services addressed the comments and concerns of the Commission and those attending the public hearing. The Municipality has developed a fact sheet that was made available at Commission Meetings and on the Municipal website. In addition there have been numerous articles on the subject of deer management in the Municipal publication, the Mt. Lebanon Magazine. On January 8, 2007 a substantial portion of the discussion session was dedicated to a conference call with an expert, Dr. J. Kilpatrick, on the issue of contraceptives for deer. The Municipality has made available both at the Municipal Building, at the Public Library and on the website an expert publication titled, "Managing White Tail Deer in Suburban Environments" by Anthony J. DeNicola and Kurt C. Verceutheren. Over the past two years the Public Works Department has received over 200 phone calls from individuals requesting information on deer management. In some instances copies of "Managing White Tail Deer in Suburban Environments" were mailed to the residents or they were informed that the document was available at the Library or the Municipal Building. Some calls were referred to the Pennsylvania Game Commission or the USDA. Copies of the approved deer management plan and "Managing White Tail Deer in Suburban Environments" are attached.

2. *The Municipality will amend local ordinances to allow for municipally controlled hunts or culling activities. Supplemental feeding ordinances should also be considered to prevent population concentrations and increased disease risk.*

On December 11, 2006 the Mt. Lebanon Commission unanimously approved Bill No. 10-06 Amending Chapter 3 Part 2 of the Mt. Lebanon Municipal Code to add an additional exception to the prohibition against discharging firearms to include persons acting on behalf of and consistent with the requirements imposed by the Municipality to carry out deer population control measures authorized by the Pennsylvania Game Commission and approved by the Mt. Lebanon Commission. At the same meeting a motion passed by a 3 to 1 vote to authorize the proper Municipal officials to file a deer management plan and apply for a Political Subdivision Permit from the Pennsylvania Game Commission. A supplemental feeding ordinance has not yet been adopted but a draft can be prepared. A copy of Bill No. 10-06 is attached.

3. *The Municipality will begin collecting data on the location of deer-vehicle collisions to be mapped, using GIS, for further review and potential revision of posted speed limits and signage.*

Since April 2007 Animal Control has been providing monthly reports listing the locations of deer carcasses removed from municipal roads. In April 2007 through August 2008 a total of 81 carcasses were removed from 69 separate locations along 34 separate roads. Roads where multiple locations include: Washington Road, with 12 separate locations ranging from Washington at Abbeyville to 100 Washington Road; six carcasses were removed along Gilkeson Road; 6 along Connor Road; 7 along Cedar Blvd., and 6 along Linderdale. Drive. In August 2008 we contacted Todd Kravits, P. E., District Traffic Engineer with PennDOT to inquire about installing deer caution signs along Washington Road, Scott Road, Connor Road, Gilkeson Road and Cedar Blvd. Mr. Kravits informed us that all deer caution or crossing signs had to be approved before the Pennsylvania Game Commission before they would be installed and maintained by PennDOT. We have contacted Matt Hough, Pennsylvania Game Commission's Regional Director and will provide him with the information we have received from Animal Control. Also, we will consult with the Pennsylvania Game Commission and Animal Control regarding signs along Cedar Blvd and Lindendale Drive. Since Animal Control is not using GPS technology to mark the locations where deer have been removed from the highway it will be difficult to prepare a concise GIS map.

4. *The Municipality will conduct deer density surveys at least once every 3 years when engaged in active population management. Density surveys will allow the Municipality to measure success of current management strategies and make adjustments when necessary. Additional information (i.e. deer-vehicle collision damage reports, etc.) should also be used to evaluate the success or the failure of management options.*

The first deer density surveys were conducted from April 21, 2006 through July 27, 2006 using Forward Looking Infra Red (FLIR) technology. The next set of deer density surveys were scheduled for late spring through early summer of 2009, however the Mt. Lebanon Commission has requested new set surveys to be performed from mid-October through mid-November 2008. The Commission has stipulated that the survey work should be provided by a qualified service provider other than the USDA Wildlife Services. To date request for proposal have been submitted to the following qualified firms: Eccologix, Wildlife Specialists and Drop Tine Wildlife. Proposals were submitted via e-mail on September 25, 2008 and the deadline for submission is 4:30 p.m. on October 7, 2008. The methodology outlined in the 2006 USDA survey document will be used to conduct the new survey. The 2006 survey work used FLIR technology and was based on survey methodology published by Dr. James Knoll in 1992. At least 4 surveys should be conducted and the final report listing survey dates and findings will be submitted to the Mt. Lebanon Commission no later than November 19, 2008. The contractor will be prepared to present his or her findings at the discussion session of the Mt. Lebanon Commission on Monday evening, November 24th. The proposals will include a description of the survey mythology, tentative work schedule and a draft of final report format, as well as a detailed listing of costs.

5. *The Municipality in cooperation with USDA APHIS Wildlife Services will apply for a political subdivision permit from the Pennsylvania Game Commission. The permit will run uninterrupted from November through March and shall cover all private (additional agreement may be required) and public land within Municipal pal boundaries.*

- *Permit will call for the removal of not more than 75 deer per year.*
- *Removal will be done by trained and certified professionals as approved by the Pennsylvania Game Commission.*
- *Sharp shooting other bait at night and trapping and euthanasia will be the only methods of take.*
- *All deer will be processed and donated for human consumption.*

The Municipality of Mt. Lebanon has made application for, and received two political subdivision permits from the Game Commission for the period between February 16, 2007 and June 30, 2007 to remove 75 deer by sharp shooting and trapping. On December 1, 2007 the Pennsylvania Game Commission approved Special Use Permit #166-2007 authorizing the Municipality to remove 150 deer effective December 1, 2007 through June 30, 2008. The USDA Wildlife Services acted as assistants to the Municipality for both Special Use Permits. All usable deer meat was donated to Western PA Food Banks, or the PA Game Commission for families in need.

6. *The Municipality will update the White Tail Deer Management Plan annually with progress reports and new research if applicable.*

The 2007 and 2008 USDA APHIS Wildlife Service Activity Summary Reports are progress reports that annually update the White Tail Deer Management Plan. There has not been any new research warranting an update of the Deer Management Plan.

7. *The Municipality will create a Deer Management Committee consisting of municipal leaders, Pennsylvania Game Commission personnel and other (i.e. PGC, USDA APHIS Wildlife Service) as appropriate. This committee shall meet annually to discuss on-going management strategy and evaluate program goals. The management goal shall be to implement measures to manage the herd at 1-3 deer per square mile, as recommended. Municipal leaders include the Mt. Lebanon Commission and the Manager.*

The Commission does not have a committee structure that meets as a committee of the whole on all matters; therefore meetings involving the Deer Management Program have involved the Commission, the Manager and representatives of USDA and the Pennsylvania Game Commission. These meetings along with the annual public meetings held on September 26, 2007 and August 25, 2008 were public meetings of the Deer Management Committee.

8. *The Municipality will require all parties engaged in active management to submit annual reports of actives for evaluation by the Deer Management Committee.*

The USDA Wildlife Service is the only entity authorized by the Municipality to conduct deer management activities within the Municipality of Mt. Lebanon. To date two annual reports have been submitted and copies are attached. The reports were submitted to the Deer Management Committee and openly discussed at public meetings in 2007 and 2008.